



West Nipissing Ouest

**CORPORATION OF THE MUNICIPALITY OF WEST NIPISSING
COUNCIL AND COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
ADDENDUM**

March 5, 2024, 6:30 PM

Pages

6. REGULAR MEETING

6.3 New Business

- | | | |
|--------|---|---|
| *6.3.6 | Resolution to Award tender for structural repairs | 3 |
| *6.3.7 | Resolution to Award Eugene Bridge Replacement | 7 |



LA CORPORATION DE LA MUNICIPALITÉ DE NIPISSING OUEST
RÉUNION DU CONSEIL ET COMITÉ PLÉNIER
ADDENDA

le 5 mars 2024, 18 h 30

	Pages
6. <u>RÉUNION RÉGULIÈRE</u>	
6.3 Affaires nouvelles	
*6.3.6 Résolution relative à l'attribution d'un appel d'offres pour des réparations structurelles	3
*6.3.7 Résolution pour l'attribution du remplacement du pont Eugène	7



West Nipissing Ouest

CORPORATION OF THE MUNICIPALITY OF WEST NIPISSING

Council - Committee of the Whole

Resolution #

Title: Resolution to Award tender for structural repairs

Date: March 5, 2024

Moved by: _____

Seconded by: _____

WHEREAS a request for quotation was made for structural repairs to bridges and large diameter culverts;
AND WHEREAS six (6) quotations were received;
AND WHEREAS the quotations were reviewed by the Director of Infrastructure and the awards being recommended herein consists of the best price meeting all of the specifications;
AND WHEREAS Council concurs with the recommendations received;
BE IT RESOLVED THAT the following awards for structural repairs be awarded as follows:

AWARDED TO	ROAD	TOTAL COST PER ROAD (plus H.S.T.)
A2Z Civil	Leclair Road	\$60,000.00
A2Z Civil	North South Road	\$75,000.00
Ed Seguin & Sons	Levac Road	\$244,990.00

CARRIED

DEFEATED

DEFEATED

**CARRIED WITH
AMENDMENTS / REFERRED /
DEFERRED / DELETED**



West Nipissing Ouest

CORPORATION DE LA MUNICIPALITÉ DE NIPISSING OUEST

Council - Committee of the Whole

Résolution #

Titre: Résolution relative à l'attribution d'un appel d'offres pour des réparations structurelles

Date: le 5 mars 2024

Proposé par: _____

Appuyé par: _____

ATTENDU QU'un appel d'offres a été lancé pour des réparations structurelles à des ponts et à des ponceaux de grand diamètre ;

ATTENDU QUE six (6) soumissions ont été reçues ;

ET ATTENDU QUE les soumissions ont été examinées par le directeur des infrastructures et que le prix recommandé ici est le meilleur prix répondant à toutes les spécifications;

ET ATTENDU QUE le conseil est d'accord avec les recommandations reçues ;

IL EST RÉSOLU QUE les prix suivants pour les réparations structurelles soient accordés comme suit :

ATTRIBUÉ À	LA ROUTE	COÛT TOTAL PAR ROUTE (plus T.V.H.)
A2Z Civil	Chemin Leclair	60 000,00
A2Z Civil	Chemin Nord-Sud	75 000,00
Ed Seguin & Sons	Chemin Levac	244 990,00

ADOPTÉ

REJETÉ

REJETÉ

**ADOPTÉ AVEC
MODIFICATIONS / REPORTÉ /
RÉFÉRÉ / RETIRÉ**

MEMORANDUM

TO: Jay Barbeau CAO

FROM: Alisa Craddock CPA, CMA

DATE: March 5, 2024

RE: Award of structural repairs

The capital budget for structural repairs includes bridge and large diameter culvert rehabilitation and replacement. The total structural repair capital budget was \$2,175,000 for 6 projects. The project budget includes cost beyond just the contractor award, such as contract administration, engineering (where applicable), materials purchased by the Municipality, and non-rebate portion of HST.

Structural repair bids came in over and under budget on individual projects, highlighting the challenges of budgeting for these projects. The Eugene Bridge process, both from a revised design and from a competitive bid process, created significant budget savings.

	Budget	Estimates
Culverts		
Labrosse	20,000.00	9,110.00
Levac	100,000.00	249,300.00
Bridges		
Savignac	24,000.00	25,440.00
Leclair	24,000.00	61,060.00
Eugene	2,000,000.00	800,000.00
North-South	7,000.00	76,320.00
	2,175,000.00	1,221,230.00

Based on the overall structural repair capital projects being within budget, it is recommended that Council proceed with the award of these projects.

Joie de vivre



www.westnipissingouest.ca



Project	Structural Repairs			
Closing Information	Thursday, January 24th @ 11:00AM EST			
Opened By	Elizabeth Henning		and	
			Melanie Ducharme	
Name	Date Received	Levac Road	Leclair Road	North South Road
DigSafe Contracting Inc	January 24, 2024	\$961,738.40	\$425,000.00	\$ 145,000.00
A2Z Civil	January 17, 2024	\$299,000.00	\$60,000.00	\$ 75,000.00
Ed Seguin & Sons	January 24, 2024	\$244,990.00	NA	NA
Auger & Sons Construction Ltd	January 24, 2024	\$339,500.00	NA	NA
MCA Contracting Ltd	January 24, 2024	DQ	DQ	DQ
LUA Construction Inc	January 24, 2024	DQ	DQ	\$ 215,709.43



West Nipissing Ovest

CORPORATION OF THE MUNICIPALITY OF WEST NIPISSING

Council - Committee of the Whole

Resolution #

Title: Resolution to Award Eugene Bridge Replacement

Date: March 5, 2024

Moved by: _____

Seconded by: _____

WHEREAS a Tender for the Eugene Road Bridge repair was opened by the Director of Infrastructure and the Director of Corporate Services

AND WHEREAS one (1) submission was received;

BE IT RESOLVED THAT the Tender for the Eugene Bridge repairs in the Municipality of West Nipissing be awarded to Ed Seguin & Sons Trucking & Paving for the sum of \$649,412.55 plus HST.

CARRIED

DEFEATED

DEFEATED

**CARRIED WITH
AMENDMENTS / REFERRED /
DEFERRED / DELETED**



CORPORATION DE LA MUNICIPALITÉ DE NIPISSING OUEST

Council - Committee of the Whole

Résolution #

Titre: Résolution pour l'attribution du remplacement du pont Eugène

Date: le 5 mars 2024

Proposé par: _____

Appuyé par: _____

ATTENDU QUE l'appel d'offres pour la réparation du pont du chemin Eugene a été ouvert par le directeur de l'Infrastructure et le directeur des Services corporatifs
ET ATTENDU QU'une (1) soumission a été reçue ;
IL EST RÉSOLU QUE la soumission pour la réparation du pont Eugene dans la municipalité de Nipissing Ouest soit accordée à Ed Seguin & Sons Trucking & Paving pour la somme de 649,412,55 \$, la TVH en sus.

ADOPTÉ

REJETÉ

REJETÉ

ADOPTÉ AVEC
MODIFICATIONS / REPORTÉ /
RÉFÉRÉ / RETIRÉ



LETTER OF TRANSMITTAL – BID EVALUATION RESULTS

March 4th, 2024

Municipality of West Nipissing

225 Holditch Street, Suite 101
Sturgeon Falls, ON, P2B 1T1

Attn: Elizabeth Henning, P. Eng
Director of Infrastructure

Re: Bid Analysis Letter – Eugene Road Bridge Replacement
Planmac Reference No. 2255

Dear Elizabeth,

Planmac reviewed five (5) tender submissions as supplied by your office on Wednesday, February 28th, 2024. Forms of tender were received from Deep Construction 2018 Inc., Dominion Construction Ltd., Ed Seguin & Sons Trucking & Paving Ltd. (low bid), MCA Contracting Ltd., and Miller Paving Limited.

It is Planmac's understanding that the Municipality of West Nipissing staff will review the tender documents with respect to the inclusion of bonds, insurance, legal requirements, and conformity to Municipality standards. It should be noted that reference checks for the bidders have not been carried out due to the limited review timeframe. From a high-level, it appears all bidders have attached their Bid Bonds and Agreements to Bond along with their submissions.

Planmac completed a review of the submitted information with respect to bid anomalies that may exist, as well as the Contractors' mathematical accuracy of the electronic bid values provided.

Overall, three (3) bidders were around 10% of Planmac's cost estimates (\$ 1,216,635.00) and two (2) were lower by approximately 30% to 50%. Ed Seguin & Sons submitted the most competitive bid of \$ 649,412.55 (excluding HST). The runner up is from Deep Construction 2018 Inc. with a bid of \$ 812,103.00.

Ed Seguin & Sons and Deep Construction offered lower unit prices for items that were per lump sum and per unit basis. Under Part A, unit prices for mobilization and



demobilization, traffic control, and construction layout were similar, but Ed Seguin & Sons offer much lower rates for the provisional excess soil management requirements and construction record data.

For Part B, Ed Seguin & Sons offered the lowest lump sum unit price of \$ 27,236 for the item of “Temporary Flow Passage System Including Cofferdams and Dewatering”. It is unclear what type of coffer dam or flow passage system that the Contractor plans to employ. The Contract expects a set of P.Eng. stamp shop drawings from the Contractor that shows the details of the overall system. In addition, the Contractor is expected to maintain and repair the overall system as required during the course of the Contract and be mindful of the weather forecast to adjust the system accordingly. The Municipality may request Ed Seguin & Sons to provide additional information whether these deliverables will be provided as part of the unit price. As for Deep Construction, they have listed an engineering firm to undertake coffer dam, demolition, and abutment engineering.

Under Part C and Part D, all bidders aside from Miller Paving reached out to the bridge supplier noted in the Tender Documents and Contract Drawings. Ed Seguin & Sons and Deep Construction offered unit prices that were below \$ 300,000, which are very competitive prices. Ed Seguin & Sons’ unit prices for civil and structural works (ie. existing bridge removal and disposal, excavation, and granular materials) were generally lower compared to Deep Construction, which gave the prior the competitive edge.

In terms of reference projects, only Dominion Construction and Miller Paving had Ministry of Transportation Ontario (MTO) project experiences and the remaining three (3) listed Municipal projects. Reference checks with the clients listed by Ed Seguin & Sons and Deep Construction is recommended.

In terms of mathematical accuracy, Ed Seguin & Sons offered unit prices with more than two (2) decimal places. This means simply inputting the unit prices as shown on their bid will not sum to the Total Value of \$ 649,412.55. The Municipality can consider requesting the Contractor to round all unit prices to the nearest two (2) decimal places should they be the successful bidder.

If the Municipality is satisfied with Ed Seguin & Sons’ response regarding temporary flow passage including coffer dam and dewatering requirements, and if all Bid Bond, Agreement to Bond, and other legal requirements are as per the Municipality standard, Planmac recommends awarding the Contract to **Ed Seguin & Sons Trucking & Paving Ltd. with a price of \$ 649,412.55 plus HST.**



We trust this is satisfactory. However, if you have any questions, please do not hesitate to call the undersigned.

Yours truly,

PLANMAC ENGINEERING INC.

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Tony Zhang".

Tony Zhang, BAsC, EIT
Civil Designer / Coordinator

Cc ***Mike Neumann, P. Eng., President – Project Manager***
 Jeff Huang, P. Eng., Vice President – Project Manager

Attachment – bid evaluation matrix

**FORM OF TENDER
SCHEDULE OF QUANTITIES & UNIT PRICES**

2024 BID ANALYSIS

Municipality of West Nipissing - Eugene Road Bridge Replacement (Modular Bridge)				Planmac Engineering Inc.		Deep Construction 2018 Inc.		Dominion Construction Ltd.		Ed Seguin & Sons Trucking & Paving Ltd.		MCA Contracting Ltd.		Miller Paving Limited		
Item No.	SP. No.	Description	Unit	Est. Qty	Unit Price	Total Price	Unit Price	Total Price	Unit Price	Total Price	Unit Price	Total Price	Unit Price	Total Price	Unit Price	Total Price
Part A - General Items																
1	-	Mobilization and Demobilization	LS	1	\$ 65,000.00	\$ 65,000.00	\$ 28,000.00	\$ 28,000.00	\$ 26,000.00	\$ 26,000.00	\$ 24,525.00	\$ 24,525.00	\$ 23,100.00	\$ 23,100.00	\$ 125,520.00	\$ 125,520.00
2	-	Traffic Control and Temporary Signage	LS	1	\$ 25,000.00	\$ 25,000.00	\$ 6,100.00	\$ 6,100.00	\$ 27,000.00	\$ 27,000.00	\$ 7,263.00	\$ 7,263.00	\$ 24,750.00	\$ 24,750.00	\$ 90,072.60	\$ 90,072.60
3	-	Construction Layout of Line and Grade	LS	1	\$ 15,000.00	\$ 15,000.00	\$ 5,200.00	\$ 5,200.00	\$ 12,000.00	\$ 12,000.00	\$ 3,353.00	\$ 3,353.00	\$ 11,000.00	\$ 11,000.00	\$ 48,000.00	\$ 48,000.00
4	-	Excess Soil Management Requirements, including Sampling, Testing, QP, and Etc. (Provisional)	LS	1	\$ 110,000.00	\$ 110,000.00	\$ 21,695.00	\$ 21,695.00	\$ 12,200.00	\$ 12,200.00	\$ 4,025.00	\$ 4,025.00	\$ 11,000.00	\$ 11,000.00	\$ 5,800.00	\$ 5,800.00
5	-	Construction Record Data	LS	1	\$ 8,000.00	\$ 8,000.00	\$ 4,470.00	\$ 4,470.00	\$ 5,600.00	\$ 5,600.00	\$ 575.00	\$ 575.00	\$ 4,950.00	\$ 4,950.00	\$ 68,850.00	\$ 68,850.00
			<i>Part A - Sub Total</i>			\$ 223,000.00		\$ 65,465.00		\$ 82,800.00		\$ 39,741.00		\$ 74,800.00		\$ 338,242.60
Part B - Environmental Works																
1	SP. 1	Temporary Flow Passage System Including Cofferdams and Dewatering	LS	1	\$ 120,000.00	\$ 120,000.00	\$ 69,895.00	\$ 69,895.00	\$ 47,255.00	\$ 47,255.00	\$ 27,236.00	\$ 27,236.00	\$ 41,800.00	\$ 41,800.00	\$ 74,180.00	\$ 74,180.00
2	SP. 2	Environmental Protection - Silt Fence	m	180	\$ 30.00	\$ 5,400.00	\$ 20.00	\$ 3,600.00	\$ 35.00	\$ 6,300.00	\$ 49.98	\$ 8,996.00	\$ 38.50	\$ 6,930.00	\$ 16.00	\$ 2,880.00
			<i>Part B - Sub Total</i>			\$ 125,400.00		\$ 73,495.00		\$ 53,555.00		\$ 36,232.00		\$ 48,730.00		\$ 77,060.00
Part C - Structural Works																
1	SP. 3	Hydro-Vac Excavation	Hr	40	\$ 650.00	\$ 26,000.00	\$ 250.00	\$ 10,000.00	\$ 650.00	\$ 26,000.00	\$ 330.00	\$ 13,200.00	\$ 596.75	\$ 23,870.00	\$ 334.50	\$ 13,380.00
2	SP. 4	Removal and Disposal of Existing Timber Bridge	LS	1	\$ 75,000.00	\$ 75,000.00	\$ 19,850.00	\$ 19,850.00	\$ 68,754.00	\$ 68,754.00	\$ 6,208.00	\$ 6,208.00	\$ 63,470.00	\$ 63,470.00	\$ 41,500.00	\$ 41,500.00
3	SP. 7	Earth Excavation - Structure	Cu. m	600	\$ 150.00	\$ 90,000.00	\$ 28.00	\$ 16,800.00	\$ 70.00	\$ 42,000.00	\$ 11.89	\$ 7,135.14	\$ 66.00	\$ 39,600.00	\$ 23.50	\$ 14,100.00
4	SP. 8	Rock Excavation (Provisional)	Cu. m	48	\$ 325.00	\$ 15,600.00	\$ 437.50	\$ 21,000.00	\$ 400.00	\$ 19,200.00	\$ 345.00	\$ 16,560.00	\$ 385.00	\$ 18,480.00	\$ 275.00	\$ 13,200.00
5	SP. 9	Supply and Install 12,400 mm x 9,360 mm Modular Bridge	Ea.	1	\$ 330,000.00	\$ 330,000.00	\$ 289,950.00	\$ 289,950.00	\$ 350,000.00	\$ 350,000.00	\$ 238,181.73	\$ 238,181.73	\$ 323,293.00	\$ 323,293.00	\$ 345,000.00	\$ 345,000.00
6	SP. 10	Supply and Install Timber Crib Foundations with Rock Backfill	Ea.	2	\$ 30,000.00	\$ 60,000.00	\$ 52,500.00	\$ 105,000.00	\$ 55,000.00	\$ 110,000.00	\$ 33,849.47	\$ 67,698.93	\$ 49,810.75	\$ 99,621.50	\$ 29,600.00	\$ 59,200.00
7	SP. 11	Supply and Place Score Protection	T	171	\$ 40.00	\$ 6,840.00	\$ 88.00	\$ 15,048.00	\$ 94.00	\$ 16,074.00	\$ 137.04	\$ 23,434.25	\$ 88.00	\$ 15,048.00	\$ 107.50	\$ 18,382.50
8	SP. 12	Supply and Pour Unshrinkable Fill Mud Mat (Provisional)	Cu. m	7	\$ 950.00	\$ 6,650.00	\$ 1,400.00	\$ 9,800.00	\$ 1,250.00	\$ 8,750.00	\$ 776.29	\$ 5,434.00	\$ 1,100.00	\$ 7,700.00	\$ 3,050.00	\$ 21,350.00
9	SP. 13	Supply and Install Steel Beam Guiderail	m	130	\$ 325.00	\$ 42,250.00	\$ 335.00	\$ 43,550.00	\$ 285.00	\$ 37,050.00	\$ 258.75	\$ 33,637.50	\$ 258.50	\$ 33,605.00	\$ 252.00	\$ 32,760.00
10	SP. 14	Supply and Install Thrie Beam Guiderail on Bridge with Transition	m	30	\$ 425.00	\$ 12,750.00	\$ 465.00	\$ 13,950.00	\$ 735.00	\$ 22,050.00	\$ 678.50	\$ 20,355.00	\$ 669.17	\$ 20,075.10	\$ 660.00	\$ 19,800.00
11	SP. 15	Supply and Install Steel Beam Attenuating Terminal System	Ea.	4	\$ 12,500.00	\$ 50,000.00	\$ 7,500.00	\$ 30,000.00	\$ 10,700.00	\$ 42,800.00	\$ 9,890.00	\$ 39,560.00	\$ 9,803.75	\$ 39,215.00	\$ 9,650.00	\$ 38,600.00
12	SP. 16	Supply and Place Granular 'A' Crib Foundation Base	T	250	\$ 50.00	\$ 12,500.00	\$ 33.00	\$ 8,250.00	\$ 80.00	\$ 20,000.00	\$ 43.45	\$ 10,862.24	\$ 71.50	\$ 17,875.00	\$ 45.00	\$ 11,250.00
13	SP. 17	Supply, Place, and Compact Granular "B" Type II Backfill	T	1350	\$ 40.00	\$ 54,000.00	\$ 30.00	\$ 40,500.00	\$ 75.00	\$ 101,250.00	\$ 28.36	\$ 38,287.57	\$ 68.20	\$ 92,070.00	\$ 38.00	\$ 51,300.00
			<i>Part C - Sub Total</i>			\$ 781,590.00		\$ 623,698.00		\$ 863,928.00		\$ 520,554.36		\$ 793,922.60		\$ 679,822.50
Part D - Civil Works																
1	SP. 5	Earth Excavation - Grading	Cu. m	541	\$ 40.00	\$ 21,640.00	\$ 15.00	\$ 8,115.00	\$ 38.00	\$ 20,558.00	\$ 11.89	\$ 6,435.00	\$ 33.00	\$ 17,853.00	\$ 27.95	\$ 15,120.95
2	SP. 6	Earth Ditch Cleanout	m	104	\$ 30.00	\$ 3,120.00	\$ 25.00	\$ 2,600.00	\$ 32.00	\$ 3,328.00	\$ 30.79	\$ 3,202.50	\$ 27.50	\$ 2,860.00	\$ 29.00	\$ 3,016.00
3	SP. 18	Supply, Place, and Compact 600mm Thick Granular 'B' Subbase	T	689	\$ 40.00	\$ 27,560.00	\$ 25.00	\$ 17,225.00	\$ 46.00	\$ 31,694.00	\$ 29.51	\$ 20,333.82	\$ 41.80	\$ 28,800.20	\$ 37.85	\$ 26,078.65
4	SP. 19	Supply and Place Granular 'A' Base and Driving Surface	T	306	\$ 50.00	\$ 15,300.00	\$ 30.00	\$ 9,180.00	\$ 47.00	\$ 14,382.00	\$ 34.51	\$ 10,559.46	\$ 42.90	\$ 13,127.40	\$ 42.80	\$ 13,096.80
5	SP. 20	Supply and Place Granular Seal	Sq. m	204	\$ 20.00	\$ 4,080.00	\$ 35.00	\$ 7,140.00	\$ 58.00	\$ 11,832.00	\$ 6.73	\$ 1,372.41	\$ 52.80	\$ 10,771.20	\$ 25.00	\$ 5,100.00
6	SP. 21	Supply and Place 100mm Topsoil	Cu. m	61	\$ 145.00	\$ 8,845.00	\$ 65.00	\$ 3,965.00	\$ 122.00	\$ 7,442.00	\$ 122.53	\$ 7,474.50	\$ 99.00	\$ 6,039.00	\$ 105.00	\$ 6,405.00
7	SP. 22	Supply and Place Terraseed	Sq. m	610	\$ 10.00	\$ 6,100.00	\$ 2.00	\$ 1,220.00	\$ 5.00	\$ 3,050.00	\$ 5.75	\$ 3,507.50	\$ 4.40	\$ 2,684.00	\$ 4.75	\$ 2,897.50
			<i>Part D - Sub Total</i>			\$ 86,645.00		\$ 49,445.00		\$ 92,286.00		\$ 52,885.19		\$ 82,134.80		\$ 71,714.90
					Total (Excluding HST)	\$ 1,216,635.00		\$ 812,103.00		\$ 1,092,569.00		\$ 649,412.55		\$ 999,587.40		\$ 1,166,840.00